

ARC Special Research Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics Charles Sturt University (at ANU) – 5 May 2005

Summary

The ARC Special Research Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics (CAPPE) was established in July 2000 as one of three Centres of Research Excellence located at the Charles Sturt University. The Centre is in its sixth year of funding at an average of \$935,000 per annum. The Centre developed from existing collaborative links between the Centre for Philosophy and Public Issues at the University of Melbourne and the Centre for Professional and Applied Ethics at Charles Sturt University. The Australian National University (ANU) became a collaborative partner in 2003. Professor Seumas Miller has been Director of CAPPE since its establishment.

The Centre has become a leading international research centre in applied philosophy and public ethics, and makes significant contributions to professional conduct, public debate and policy in the field. CAPPE has attracted eminent scholars as research staff and visitors, and has expanded the scale of its operations and international impact and connections. Since the 2002 Review, CAPPE has strengthened its focus in six core research programs: criminal justice ethics, ethical issues in biotechnology, ethics of IT and emergent technologies, business and professional ethics, welfare ethics, and ethical issues in political violence and state sovereignty. New opportunities for future research have been identified in the areas of ethical issues in natural resource allocation and the ethics of international institutions.

The six-year review of CAPPE took place at the Australian National University node on 5 May 2005. The Review Panel comprised Professor David Goodman (Pro Vice Chancellor, International, University of Technology, Sydney) and Dr Mandy Thomas (Executive Director, Humanities and Creative Arts, ARC).

Prior to the review, Panel members were provided with a submission from Charles Sturt University, a submission from the Centre Director, a copy of CAPPE's 2004 Annual Report and a copy of the review report from the 2002 Review. During the review the Panel viewed CAPPE's ANU facilities and equipment; met with staff, students, and external representatives; and undertook discussions with Professor Miller, Deputy Director Associate Professor Janna Thompson and senior executives from all universities involved in the Centre.

The Review Panel concluded that CAPPE is expanding the scale and impact of its research and program development and is continuing to perform exceptionally well. The quality and quantity of its research is impressive and its operative model and process of public engagement have been receiving significant international recognition. It has a wide range of industry partners who are strongly supportive of its work and international partnerships that offer sustainable increasing potential. Its earned revenue is growing correspondingly.

Recommendation

The Review Panel recommends that funding for the ARC Special Research Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics Research be continued for a further three years at the current level of \$962,270 per annum in 2005 dollars, indexed every year in accordance with normal ARC funding arrangements.

The Review Panel also recommends that the Centre:

- strengthen the mechanisms of strategic thinking and governance, focusing on generic documentation and processes for planning, management and operational reviews;
- increase CAPPE exposure and visual presence, e.g. better badging and Centre promotions with a view to giving the Centre more prominence generally, but particularly as a single corporate identity;
- explore opportunities for the expansion of Centre facilities, interfaculty collaborations and teaching opportunities at ANU in particular;
- identify a postgraduate and research training coordinator and encourage all staff and students to engage in professional development programs, particularly in commercialisation;
- focus more strongly on commercialisation opportunities for the Centre, especially in the area of maintaining ownership of the translation of CAPPE-generated teaching materials into other languages and their use in other countries; and
- explore the area of cross-cultural ethics and the ethics of translation, and possible linkages with other discipline groups to support these initiatives.

Centre achievements assessed against performance criteria

The following report is based on the ARC Special Research Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics' (CAPPE) submission to the ARC, CAPPE's annual reports and discussions held by the ARC Review Panel on 5 May 2005.

1. Publications and research outcomes

The Review Panel was impressed by the continued growth of research publications, teaching materials and other output of the Centre, which has shown itself to be at the forefront of research advancement and excellence in its field. Between 2002 and mid-2005, CAPPE members have published or have under contract approximately double the number of publications reported in the 2002 Centre Review, with 30 authored and 35 edited books, many with leading international publishers; editorship of two leading international journals and three national journals and the world's largest on-line reference work; and 380 refereed articles or book chapters with articles appearing in major international journals concerned with applied philosophy and public ethics.

A number of books authored by CAPPE members have been the subject of panel discussions and extended commentary at international conferences. These levels of publication indicate that CAPPE's performance expectations have been exceeded in each year of its second triennium.

The Panel considered that the current activities of CAPPE provide a sound springboard for a considerable extension of research and training activities that will provide avenues to income as well as an expansion in collaborative and applied research. For example, the ethics and fraud training program for the Australian Taxation Office has resulted in a state-of-the-art DVD and a detailed set of instructor notes. A question of ownership of the intellectual property in any subsequent translations and on-sales may have to be resolved however.

The Review Panel acknowledged the growth in quality and impact of CAPPE research, services, and products. The Panel considers this expansion is sustainable and could be increased even further through judicious exploration of the commercialisation of CAPPE linkage research, teaching materials and consultancy packages.

2. Linkages, visibility and reputation

The Review Panel noted that CAPPE's international reputation is attested by its recognised publishing rate of refereed articles and presence in international journal publications, and also by international invitations and visitors, and the growth in appointments of eminent world scholars to the Centre.

The Review Panel was impressed with the expanding potential of international collaborations and appointments. In the second triennium of its operations, CAPPE attracted leading international applied philosophers and public ethics researchers as long term research/teaching appointments, or 50:50 shared funding appointments, and short term visitors. The academic staff recruited to CAPPE are a mix of senior researchers with established international reputations and high-quality researchers at the beginning or middle of their research careers. The connections and reputation these scholars and visitors bring with them is opening up opportunities for collaborative research and consultancies of international potential as well as further international recognition of the CAPPE operative model.

The Centre has been responsible for developing a critical focus on ethical issues of interest in Australia and overseas. Areas of note include rapid response to unresolved or unanticipated issues of ethics in terrorism policy and strategies, and the ability to 'design in' ethical elements in

technical research and biosciences legislation. The Review Panel noted the critical contributions these make to National Research Priorities and to public discussion of the ethical issues that are at the heart of many recent and ongoing controversies in Australian public life.

Since 2002, CAPPE has undertaken 14 consultancy projects. Industry partners all voiced a high regard for the accessibility of CAPPE staff and the quality of CAPPE consultations and teaching materials.

CAPPE members have undertaken consultancies for a range of Australian and overseas public sector organisations, including the NSW Professional Standards Council (development of a Model Code of Ethics); the Indian Police Service (a research project on Police Ethics); and the Australian Defence Force (a Review of Current Policy and Procedures on Detention). CAPPE is a major partner in the ARC-funded Research Network *The Governance Network (GovNet)*.

The CAPPE model of combining scholarship and research with world-leading strategic focus on practical issues is receiving attention outside Australia as a potential benchmark for the field. The Review Panel considers that the Centre is at the forefront of contemporary work in applied ethics. The number of CAPPE members giving keynote presentations at international forums continues to grow. Sponsored public lectures and other outreach activities are recognised as being strongly developed.

Questions were raised by the Panel on the visibility of the Centre in its location at ANU, and the extent of external knowledge of its activities in the ANU community. The Review Panel highlighted the importance of Centre promotion within ANU and suggested greater emphasis could be given to exploring cross-faculty interactions for potential teaching opportunities and accessing the wealth of ANU expertise for possible research collaborations. In addition, all three nodes could more effectively promote CAPPE as a single coherent multi-institution Centre rather than only focus on their single nodes. This would more effectively badge CAPPE as a solid multi-node entity rather than disparate institutional strands. Examples of some methods by which a single corporate identity might be manifested is through unified branding of its publications and stationery, as well as in its electronic communications and through its exposure on the world wide web.

3. Research training and coursework

The Review Panel is satisfied that CAPPE can sustain projected growth in its numbers of postgraduate coursework and research students. Coursework programs are attracting professionals who bring a strong practical focus to their studies. The higher degree research cohort has grown from 12.875 EFTSU enrolled at CAPPE nodes in 2001 to 30 EFTSU in 2005. The Centre has attracted world-leading researchers and is now also gaining strong international postgraduate research candidates.

Student representatives spoke highly to the Panel about the quality of research supervision in CAPPE and the accessibility and generosity of staff in the interest and time they provided, especially those at the Melbourne node. Facilities at the University of Melbourne are regarded as excellent and a number of research students commented on the support funding available for them to present their findings at international conferences. Charles Sturt University postgraduate research students are currently housed at the ANU node of CAPPE, but teaching opportunities for these students are limited at the ANU.

The Panel considered that the growth in collaborative research ventures and associated funding programs that can support postgraduate research with APAI scholarships and/or potential part time research associate positions would ensure viable growth in research enrolments.

The Review Panel suggested that appointing a Centre postgraduate research student coordinator would strengthen research training. Such a person may also be able to seek appropriate teaching opportunities for candidates in ANU faculties.

4. Viability

4.1 Host institution support

Charles Sturt University has identified CAPPE as one of its two Centres of Research Excellence, and has assigned the highest priority to its support and continued development. CAPPE teaching activities are mainly located at Charles Sturt University which actively embeds CAPPE's activities within CSU's teaching and research activities. The University of Melbourne has also noted the significance of CAPPE's international profile and has made a firm commitment to ongoing funding and support for the Centre's research. The third node of CAPPE at the ANU (established in 2003) has become the principal location for Centre research and management. The Review Panel considered that the move to the ANU will allow CAPPE to continue its good progress for the coming three years and beyond. The Panel considered however that there is a need for attention to be paid to the adequacy of space and facilities at the ANU node, and its promotion on campus.

The Panel noted that for the 2006-08 triennium, the universities have committed a total of \$1,110,000 per annum, comprising \$430,000 and \$250,000 in cash from the University of Melbourne and the ANU, respectively, and \$75,000 for the Director's salary plus \$355,000 in cash from Charles Sturt University¹.

4.2 External financial support

The Panel considered that CAPPE has continued to exceed its performance targets for earned revenue from grants and consultancies and other sources: in 2000 earned revenue was 13% of total revenue, with this figure rising to 22% in 2002 and 28% in 2004. External revenue is projected to rise from \$970,000 in 2005 to \$1,450,000 in 2008. Professor Miller reported that total revenue had doubled from 2000 to 2005 and that external revenue for 2005 had already achieved \$866,000, well in excess of the target of \$700,000.

CAPPE plans to increase earned revenue through consultancies and research grants, with targets set for each of the core research programs. The Panel noted that CAPPE's success in winning a number of research grants and consultancies has provided a foundation for attracting further financial support.

5. Strategic planning

CAPPE's management and Advisory Board have demonstrated a capacity to implement strategies for achieving considerable international impact and recognition in a strong focused manner. During the site visits in 2002, the Review Panel suggested that CAPPE should concentrate its resources in those research areas where it was likely to have the greatest impact. The Centre responded with a revised structure of identified 'core programs', which has ensured that the focus and scale of CAPPE's initiatives have enabled it to achieve greater strength and standing.

Strategic plans have been developed for each of the core programs which have documented strong performance and the identification of developing issues to which the area member's experience and research could be applied. Two new areas in the ethics of natural resource

¹ Calculated from the *Indicative Budget 2005-2008, CAPPE Director's Submission*, April 2005, pp.62.

allocation and the ethics of international institutions have well-developed strategic plans. An application has been made for increased ARC funding from the Special Research Centre scheme. The Review Panel advised that additional ARC funding was unavailable for the remaining triennium, but they are satisfied that these new areas are likely to remain viable without this requested funding.

The Review Panel suggested there is scope for strengthening the Centre's sustainability and essential dynamics of staff and student goodwill that contribute to Centre management, through the documentation of its strategic development processes beyond the identified key performance indicators and budgets. Generic processes could be developed for the identification and exploration of emerging issues of relevance to CAPPE and the potential transition of core research areas into critical new areas of focus, with documented mechanisms that would ensure CAPPE's continued success and expansion.

6. Management and structure

The Centre Director, Professor Seumas Miller, is based in Canberra and is responsible for the academic leadership and operational management of CAPPE. The previous Melbourne-based Deputy Director, Professor Tony Coady, has been replaced by Associate Professor Janna Thompson. CAPPE's management has been challenged by the necessity for effective coordination and communication between the Melbourne and Canberra nodes in particular. The Panel found that this challenge had been addressed satisfactorily by Professor Seumas Miller travelling frequently between Centre nodes and through the use of state of the art video conferencing facilities.

Each core program has a Program Manager and a Deputy Program Manager who is based in another node to that in which the Program Manager is located. The Review Panel considers there is considerable strength of management in each of the CAPPE core programs, but more emphasis could be placed on the collective interaction of Program Managers with the Centre Management Committee.

The Panel considered that CAPPE is well-served by its Advisory Board, which is now chaired by the Hon Margaret Reid (from 1 July 2004) after the retirement of the Hon Dame Margaret Guilfoyle DBE. CAPPE's industry and 'end-user' linkages are strengthened by the membership of the Advisory Board, comprising leading academics, industry sponsors, heads of key national organisations and leading professionals. Membership has varied in the second triennium to now include the Rt Hon Sir Ninian Stephen, the Hon Justice Michael Kirby, Commissioner Ken Moroney (NSW Police Service), Professor Robert Fullinwider (University of Maryland), and John Ridge (President Australian Computer Society). On behalf of the Board, the Hon Margaret Reid spoke to the Review Panel, expressing their support and judgement that CAPPE is creating an international 'voice' of recognised standing and plays a significant part in Australian public life.

7. Assessment

The Review Panel is impressed with the expansion of CAPPE, which is evident in strength against all performance indicators. Since the Centre was reviewed in 2002, the addition of the ANU as an institutional partner has enabled the development of a presence in Canberra and strengthened CAPPE focus in the six core research areas with key appointments to staff. The international reputation of CAPPE researchers and outcomes, consultancies, and collaborative linkages have grown accordingly.

CAPPE's funded cohort of academic staff, including some of the world's leading applied philosophers, makes it the largest research centre of its kind. The CAPPE model of blending depth of research and presence in the public sphere with close attention to the concrete problems and interactive feedback from clients and practitioners, sets the Centre apart with a distinctive profile. The Panel concluded that with judicious attention to developing the collective synergy and potential commercial spin-offs and consultancies, CAPPE has established a sound foundation for continued success.

Appendices

Appendix 1 Review Panel members and people consulted

Appendix 2 Performance criteria

Review Panel

Dr Mandy Thomas
Executive Director, Humanities and Creative Arts
Australian Research Council

Professor David Goodman
Director, Institute for International Studies
The University of Technology, Sydney

Secretariat support

Ms Marieka Easterley
Humanities and Creative Arts
Australian Research Council

Key people consulted

CAPPE management

Professor Seumas Miller, Director
Associate Professor Janna Thompson, Deputy Director
Margaret Reid, Chair, CAPPE Advisory Board

Charles Sturt University Executive

Professor Ross Chambers, Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Academic)
Professor Paul Burnett, Pro Vice-Chancellor (Research)

University of Melbourne Executive

Professor Frank Larkins Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research)

The Australian National University Executive

Professor Lawrence Cram, Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research)
Professor Adam Shoemaker, Dean of Arts

CAPPE staff

Professor Tom Campbell, Professor John Kleinig, Professor Jeroen van den Hoven, Professor John Weckert, Assoc. Professor Jeanette Kennett, Dr Andrew Alexandra, Dr Yeslam Al-Saggaf, Dr Steve Clarke, Dr Dean Cocking, Dr Steve Coleman, Dr Keith Horton, Dr Neil Levy, Dr Stephen Matthews, Dr Jeremy Moss, Dr Emma Rooksby, Dr Edward Spence, Jessica Wolfendale, Kylie Williams

CAPPE administrative staff

Ross Cornwell, Centre Manager

CAPPE end-users

David Bradley, Office of Chief Commissioner, Victoria Police
Greg Chilvers, Director, Research and Resources Centre, NSW Police Association
John Ridge, Executive Director, Australian Computer Society Foundation
James Ryan, Director, ACT Corrective Services
Brian Slater, Internal Assurance, Australian Taxation Office

Apologies

Bernie Marden, Secretary, Professional Standards Council of NSW

Paul Malone, Director, Fraud Prevention and Control, Australian Taxation Office

CAPPE students

Mike Bower, Emma Larking, Richard Lucas, Clare McCausland, Aaron Quinn, Maria Rodriguez, Philipa Smales, Charles Summers, Mathew Ward

Apologies

Rekha Nath

Performance criteria

1. Centre achievements with respect to SRC program aims and objectives
 - i. established concentration of quality researchers and resources, ability to attract high quality research staff,
 - ii. research advancement and excellence as measured by national and international publications, conference participation and collaboration,
 - iii. provision of high quality research environments for postgraduate and postdoctoral research training,
 - iv. promotion of research which is of national benefit to Australia,
 - v. centre's interaction with the private sector, State and Commonwealth Governments including evidence of centre's ability to attract financial contributions from external sources, potential commercial applications of research, reputation and visibility within the institution and the wider community.
2. Centre achievements with respect to the Centre's objectives, as set out in original application.
3. Management and structure
 - vi. role of director i.e. leadership and vision, role of advisory board,
 - vii. efficacy of administration and management committees,
 - viii. strategic plan – does plan contain measurable performance indicators and time frames,
 - ix. financial management including current expenditure, future budget plans, adequate income and expenditure statements.
4. Viability
 - x. relationship between the centre's objectives and the research management plan of the institution,
 - xi. extent of institution's support with respect to the initial commitment, future commitment, and strategies for reintegration into the university at the conclusion of funding.